CASE SUMMARY

APPLICATION TYPE: GENERAL REZONING

File Number:12-D-10-RZRelated File Number:Application Filed:11/15/2010Date of Revision:Applicant:KNOXVILLE CITY COUNCIL



Suite 403 • City County Building 4 0 0 Main Street Knoxville, Tennessee 37902 8 6 5 • 2 1 5 • 2 5 0 0 F A X • 2 1 5 • 2 0 6 8 w w w • k n o x m p c • o r g

PROPERTY INFORMATION

General Location: Park locations city-wide

Other Parcel Info.:

Tax ID Number: 999 999 Jurisdiction: City

Size of Tract: Accessibility:

GENERAL LAND USE INFORMATION

Existing Land Use:

Surrounding Land Use:

Proposed Use: Density:

Sector Plan: Sector Plan Designation:

Growth Policy Plan: Urban Growth Area (Inside City Limits)

Neighborhood Context:

ADDRESS/RIGHT-OF-WAY INFORMATION (where applicable)

Street:

Location:

Proposed Street Name:

Department-Utility Report:

Reason:

ZONING INFORMATION (where applicable)

Current Zoning: Various zones

Former Zoning:

Requested Zoning: OS-1 (Open Space Preservation) or newly created zone

Previous Requests: None noted

Extension of Zone:

History of Zoning:

PLAN INFORMATION (where applicable)

Current Plan Category:

Requested Plan Category:

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 1 of 9

SUBDIVISION INFORMATION (where applicable)

Subdivision Name:

No. of Lots Proposed: No. of Lots Approved: 0

Variances Requested:

S/D Name Change:

OTHER INFORMATION (where applicable)

Other Bus./Ord. Amend.:

MPC ACTION AND DISPOSITION

Planner In Charge: Michael Brusseau

Staff Recomm. (Abbr.): rezone parks in the City and that City Council retain the zoning of certain parks and park areas as

shown in Exhibit A

Staff Recomm. (Full): REQUEST:

City Council has postponed until January 11, 2011, a rezoning of public parks in the City to OS-1, pending consideration of and a recommendation by the MPC regarding ordinance amendments to change the regulations of the OS-1 (Open Space Preservation) and/or the addition of a new district to provide regulation of land for active park and recreation use. Discussion around this request included a request to consider the use of an amended OS-1 district or a new park district for all public park lands in the city. Items 6 and 7 on this agenda consider amendments to the current OS-1 district (item 6) and the proposed new OS-2 (Park and Open Space) district. This item will provide a recommendation to rezone the city's public park and open space land to the OS-1 and OS-2 districts.

BACKGROUND:

Resolution R-116-2010, approved by City Council on April 20, 2010, requests that MPC consider the rezoning of all land located within all City parks listed in the Resolution and all park expansion areas from their current zoning classification to OS-1 (Open Space) district and to consider the placement of conditions on these park lands that would prohibit and restrict the development of residences, marinas or cellular communication towers on these properties. In August, after careful review by staff of all park lands and proposed park expansion areas in the city, MPC recommended the rezoning of a limited number of park lands or proposed park lands to OS-1, finding that the current OS-1 development regulations were not suitable for active park and recreation lands, and that Council do not remove the uses permitted on review from the rezoning. The following were recommended for OS-1 because they met the purpose of the OS-1 zone district to preserve open space and the OS-1 development regulations posed no threat to future active park and recreation facilities:

- Buck Toms Park
- •Westview Park
- •Riverbluff Wildlife Area
- •Loghaven Conservation Area
- •ljams Nature Center (remainder not already zoned OS-1)•Forks of the River Wildlife Management Area
- •Ten Mile Creek Greenway Park
- •Turkey Creek Conservation Area
- •William Hastie Park

At its October 19th meeting City Council passed a resolution requesting MPC make a recommendation on the "most effective method to afford zoning protection to all city parks" and to consider amending OS-1 and creating a new zone district. Previous items on this agenda indicate that staff believes amendments to the current OS-1 district AND a new OS-2 district is the best method to achieve the goal of protecting through zoning the park and recreation lands, as well as the preservation of open space, in the city.

ANALYSIS:

This recommendation will consider all publicly owned land used for parks or recreation facilities, as well as land that is privately owned but managed and used by the City Parks and Recreation department for public use. It will include the park and recreation lands and facilities have been zoned OS-1 in the past, many of which do not meet the development regulations of the current OS-1 district.

The recommendation to rezone lands to the OS-1 and OS-2 districts will are grouped as follows:
•Land that is owned by the City and is currently zoned OS-1;

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 2 of 9

- •Land that is owned by the City and is currently not zoned OS-1;
- •Land owned by others that is currently zoned OS-1;
- •Land owned by others that is currently not zoned OS-1; and
- •Recreation Centers owned and operated by the City and are currently not zoned OS-1.

In addition, the recommendation will consider certain park lands that may be better off zoned something other than OS-1 or OS-2.

Staff has reviewed all park lands within the City and conferred with the City of Knoxville Parks and Recreation Department.

Park Lands Recommended for OS-1 zoning. In general these are larger tracts with conservation open space the predominant land use.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned OS-1 and should remain OS-1, subject to the proposed amendments to the OS-1 district:

- •Adair Park South of Adair Drive
- •Charter E Doyle Park
- •Knoxville Municipal Golf Course
- •Luxmore Drive Natural Area
- Stanley Lippencott Ridge Park
- •William Hastie Park

The following park lands owned by Knox County are now zoned OS-1 and should remain OS-1:

Meads Quarry

The Fort Dickerson Park currently has a combination of OS-1/H-1 on most of the property and H-1 alone on a 6 acre portion of the property. H-1 is an overlay district. It must have a basic zone district classification as well. All of the Fort Dickerson Park Property should be zoned OS-1 with the H-1 overlay.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-1, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1, subject to the proposed amendments to the OS-1 district:

- •Buck Toms Park;
- First Creek Park;
- •ljams Nature Center;
- •Sharps Ridge Memorial Park;
- •Ten Mile Creek Greenway Park;•Third Creek Greenway Park;
- •Turkey Creek;
- •Wee Course at Williams Creek;
- •Whittle Springs Golf Course.

The following park lands owned by entities other than the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-1, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1, subject to the proposed amendments to the OS-1 district:

- •Badgett Road Park #1, owned by United States of America;
- •Forks of the River Wildlife Management Area, owned by State of Tennessee;
- •Houser Road Park #1, owned by TVA;
- •Houser Road Park #2. owned by TVA:
- •I.C. King Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Lyons Bend Park, owned by United States of America; and
- •River Bluff Wildlife Area, owned by Legacy Parks Foundation.

Park Lands Recommended for OS-2 zoning. In general these are smaller multi-use tracts or large tracts with recreation open space and recreation centers as the predominant land use. These park lands would not be suitable for the 5 percent maximum impervious surface coverage that is proposed for the OS-1 district and would be better suited for the more intensive regulations of OS-2, which would allow the expansion of recreation facilities in these parks.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned OS-1 and but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 3 of 9

should be retained, subject to the adoption of the proposed OS-2 district:

- •Adair Park North of Adair Drive;
- •Alice Bell Park & Ballfields;
- •Babe Ruth Park;
- •Cal Johnson Park;
- •Dr. Walter Hardy Park;
- •Edgewood Park;
- •Fourth and Gill Park;
- Holston River Park;
- •Inskip Ballfields;
- •Island Home Park;
- James Smith Park;
- •Lonsdale Park;
- •Marie Meyers Park;•Mary James park;
- •Mary Vestal Park;
- •Meadow Circle Park;
- North Hills Park;
- •Rocky Hill Ballfields;
- •S & J Colquitt Memorial Park;
- Safety City Park;
- •Sam Duff Park;
- Skyline Park;
- •Tvson Park:
- Union Square Park;
- •Victor Ashe Park; and
- •Whitlow-Logan Park

The following park lands owned by others are now zoned OS-1 and but should be zoned OS-2, subject to the adoption of the proposed OS-2 district:

- •Frajan Campbell Park, owned by Frajan Campbell; and
- •Gov. McWerther / Riverside Landing Park, owned by State of Tennessee.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Alex Haley Heritage Square;
- •Ashley Nicole Dream Playground;
- Baxter Avenue Park;
- Caswell Park;
- •Cecil Webb Park;
- •Claude Walker Ballfields;
- Chilhowee Park;
- Christenberry Ballfields;
- •Ed Cothren Pool;
- •Fort Kid Park;
- •Fountain City Skate Park;
- •Gary Underwood Park;
- Highland Neighborhood Park;
- •James Agee Park;
- •Joe Foster Park;
- •Lakeshore, Parcel #1;•Malcolm Martin Park;
- Morningside Park;
- •Old North Knoxville Park:
- •Olde Mechanicsville Park;
- Parkridge Park;
- •Reed and Baxter Park;
- •Rock City Park;
- •Roseanne Wolfe Picnic Area;
- •Sam E. Hill Park;
- Scottish Pike Park;
- •Scott-Roberts Park:
- Sequoyah Hills Park;
- •Talahi Park;
- •West Hills / John Bynon Park;
- •Westview Park; and
- •Westwood Park.

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 4 of 9

The following park lands owned by entities other than the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Badgett Fields, owned by Badgett Life Estate:
- •Bearden Middle School Ballfields, owned by Knox County;
- •Community Unity Park, owned by Knoxville Housing Authority;
- •Forest Heights Neighborhood Park, owned by Higland Hills Commercial Center Playground;
- •Fountain City Ballfields, owned by Fountain City Recreation Association;
- •Fountain City Lake and Park, Owned by Fountain City Park Company;
- •Fulton Bicentennial Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Harriet Tubman Park, owned by Knoxville Housing Authority;
- •Holston Chilhowee Ballfields, owned by Holston Hills Community Club;
- •John Tarleton Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Linden Avenue Park, owned by Knoxville Housing Authority;
- •Loves Creek at Holston Middle School, owned by Knox County
- •Maloney Road Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Marine Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Maynard Glenn Ballfields, owned by State of Tennessee;
- •Mount Castle Park, owned by University of Tennessee;
- •Northshore Town Center Parks #1, #2, #3, #4, owned by Northshore Market Investor LLC;
- •Northwest Middle School Park, owned by Knox County;
- Petsafe Downtown Dog Park, owned by Tennessee DOT;
- Sequovah Hills Park, owned by TVA:
- Spring Place Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Thomas "Tank" Strickland Park, owned by Knox County; and
- •YMCA at West Hills / John Bynon Park, owned by YMCA.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- Christenberry Community Center;
- •Cumberland Estates Recreation Center;
- •Deane Hill Recreation Center;
- •E.V. Davidson Recreation Center;
- •Fairview Recreation Center;
- •Happy Homes Community Center;•Knoxville Adaptive Recreation Center;
- •Larry Cox Senior Center:
- •Milton Roberts Recreation Center;
- •New Hope Recreation Center;
- •Oakland Recreation Center; and
- •West Haven Recreation Center.

Parks recommended to retain the same zoning. The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 and should remain zoned as they are. All but Lakeshore, parcel #2 are located downtown and have a D-1 overlay for protection. Lakeshore, parcel #2, currently is occupied by uses not listed in either the OS-1 or OS-2 zone districts, as proposed. If the desire of the planning commission is to recommend a change of zoning, these park lands should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Flood Way) district should remain F-1 and the D-1 overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Charles Krutch Park
- •Market Square
- •World's Fair Park•Volunteer Landing Park
- •Lakeshore, Parcel #2
- •Badgett Road Parks #2 and #3

Comments: REQUEST:

City Council has postponed until January 11, 2011, a rezoning of public parks in the City to OS-1, pending consideration of and a recommendation by the MPC regarding ordinance amendments to change the regulations of the OS-1 (Open Space Preservation) and/or the addition of a new district to provide regulation of land for active park and recreation use. Discussion around this request included a request to consider the use of an amended OS-1 district or a new park district for all public park lands in the city. Items 6 and 7 on this agenda consider amendments to the current OS-1 district (item 6) and the proposed new OS-2 (Park and Open Space) district. This item will provide a recommendation to rezone the city's public park and open space land to the OS-1 and OS-2 districts.

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 5 of 9

BACKGROUND:

Resolution R-116-2010, approved by City Council on April 20, 2010, requests that MPC consider the rezoning of all land located within all City parks listed in the Resolution and all park expansion areas from their current zoning classification to OS-1 (Open Space) district and to consider the placement of conditions on these park lands that would prohibit and restrict the development of residences, marinas or cellular communication towers on these properties. In August, after careful review by staff of all park lands and proposed park expansion areas in the city, MPC recommended the rezoning of a limited number of park lands or proposed park lands to OS-1, finding that the current OS-1 development regulations were not suitable for active park and recreation lands, and that Council do not remove the uses permitted on review from the rezoning. The following were recommended for OS-1 because they met the purpose of the OS-1 zone district to preserve open space and the OS-1 development regulations posed no threat to future active park and recreation facilities:

- Buck Toms Park
- •Westview Park
- •Riverbluff Wildlife Area
- Loghaven Conservation Area
- •ljams Nature Center (remainder not already zoned OS-1)•Forks of the River Wildlife Management Area
- •Ten Mile Creek Greenway Park
- •Turkey Creek Conservation Area
- •William Hastie Park

At its October 19th meeting City Council passed a resolution requesting MPC make a recommendation on the "most effective method to afford zoning protection to all city parks" and to consider amending OS-1 and creating a new zone district. Previous items on this agenda indicate that staff believes amendments to the current OS-1 district AND a new OS-2 district is the best method to achieve the goal of protecting through zoning the park and recreation lands, as well as the preservation of open space, in the city.

ANALYSIS:

This recommendation will consider all publicly owned land used for parks or recreation facilities, as well as land that is privately owned but managed and used by the City Parks and Recreation department for public use. It will include the park and recreation lands and facilities have been zoned OS-1 in the past, many of which do not meet the development regulations of the current OS-1 district.

The recommendation to rezone lands to the OS-1 and OS-2 districts will are grouped as follows:

- •Land that is owned by the City and is currently zoned OS-1:
- •Land that is owned by the City and is currently not zoned OS-1;
- •Land owned by others that is currently zoned OS-1;
- •Land owned by others that is currently not zoned OS-1; and
- •Recreation Centers owned and operated by the City and are currently not zoned OS-1.

In addition, the recommendation will consider certain park lands that may be better off zoned something other than OS-1 or OS-2.

Staff has reviewed all park lands within the City and conferred with the City of Knoxville Parks and Recreation Department.

Park Lands Recommended for OS-1 zoning. In general these are larger tracts with conservation open space the predominant land use.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned OS-1 and should remain OS-1, subject to the proposed amendments to the OS-1 district:

- •Adair Park South of Adair Drive
- •Charter E Doyle Park
- •Knoxville Municipal Golf Course
- •Luxmore Drive Natural Area
- •Stanley Lippencott Ridge Park
- •William Hastie Park

The following park lands owned by Knox County are now zoned OS-1 and should remain OS-1:

Meads Quarry

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 6 of 9

The Fort Dickerson Park currently has a combination of OS-1/H-1 on most of the property and H-1 alone on a 6 acre portion of the property. H-1 is an overlay district. It must have a basic zone district classification as well. All of the Fort Dickerson Park Property should be zoned OS-1 with the H-1 overlay.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-1, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1, subject to the proposed amendments to the OS-1 district:

- Buck Toms Park;
- First Creek Park;
- •ljams Nature Center;
- •Sharps Ridge Memorial Park;
- •Ten Mile Creek Greenway Park: •Third Creek Greenway Park:
- •Turkev Creek:
- •Wee Course at Williams Creek:
- •Whittle Springs Golf Course.

The following park lands owned by entities other than the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-1, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1, subject to the proposed amendments to the OS-1 district:

- •Badgett Road Park #1, owned by United States of America;
- •Forks of the River Wildlife Management Area, owned by State of Tennessee;
- Houser Road Park #1, owned by TVA;
- •Houser Road Park #2, owned by TVA;
- •I.C. King Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Lyons Bend Park, owned by United States of America; and
- •River Bluff Wildlife Area, owned by Legacy Parks Foundation.

Park Lands Recommended for OS-2 zoning. In general these are smaller multi-use tracts or large tracts with recreation open space and recreation centers as the predominant land use. These park lands would not be suitable for the 5 percent maximum impervious surface coverage that is proposed for the OS-1 district and would be better suited for the more intensive regulations of OS-2, which would allow the expansion of recreation facilities in these parks.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned OS-1 and but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the proposed OS-2 district:

- •Adair Park North of Adair Drive;
- •Alice Bell Park & Ballfields;
- •Babe Ruth Park;
- •Cal Johnson Park;
- •Dr. Walter Hardy Park;
- •Edgewood Park;
- •Fourth and Gill Park;
- Holston River Park;
- •Inskip Ballfields;
- •Island Home Park;
- •James Smith Park;
- •Lonsdale Park;
- •Marie Meyers Park;•Mary James park;
- Mary Vestal Park;
- •Meadow Circle Park;
- •North Hills Park;
- Rocky Hill Ballfields;
- •S & J Colquitt Memorial Park;
- Safety City Park;
- •Sam Duff Park;
- Skyline Park;
- •Tyson Park;
- •Union Square Park:
- •Victor Ashe Park; and
- •Whitlow-Logan Park

The following park lands owned by others are now zoned OS-1 and but should be zoned OS-2, subject to the adoption of the proposed OS-2 district:

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 7 of 9

- •Frajan Campbell Park, owned by Frajan Campbell; and
- •Gov. McWerther / Riverside Landing Park, owned by State of Tennessee.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Alex Haley Heritage Square;
- •Ashley Nicole Dream Playground;
- Baxter Avenue Park;
- •Caswell Park;
- Cecil Webb Park;
- •Claude Walker Ballfields;
- •Chilhowee Park:
- Christenberry Ballfields;
- •Ed Cothren Pool:
- •Fort Kid Park;
- •Fountain City Skate Park;
- •Gary Underwood Park;
- •Highland Neighborhood Park;
- •James Agee Park;
- Joe Foster Park;
- •Lakeshore, Parcel #1:•Malcolm Martin Park;
- Morningside Park;
- •Old North Knoxville Park;
- •Olde Mechanicsville Park;
- Parkridge Park;
- •Reed and Baxter Park;
- Rock City Park;
- •Roseanne Wolfe Picnic Area;
- •Sam E. Hill Park;
- Scottish Pike Park;
- Scott-Roberts Park;
- Sequoyah Hills Park;
- •Talahi Park;
- •West Hills / John Bynon Park;
- •Westview Park; and
- •Westwood Park.

The following park lands owned by entities other than the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Badgett Fields, owned by Badgett Life Estate;
- •Bearden Middle School Ballfields, owned by Knox County;
- •Community Unity Park, owned by Knoxville Housing Authority;
- •Forest Heights Neighborhood Park, owned by Higland Hills Commercial Center Playground;
- •Fountain City Ballfields, owned by Fountain City Recreation Association;
- •Fountain City Lake and Park, Owned by Fountain City Park Company;
- •Fulton Bicentennial Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Harriet Tubman Park, owned by Knoxville Housing Authority;
- •Holston Chilhowee Ballfields, owned by Holston Hills Community Club;
- •John Tarleton Park, owned by Knox County;
- Linden Avenue Park, owned by Knoxville Housing Authority;
- •Loves Creek at Holston Middle School, owned by Knox County
- •Maloney Road Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Marine Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Maynard Glenn Ballfields, owned by State of Tennessee;
- •Mount Castle Park, owned by University of Tennessee;
- •Northshore Town Center Parks #1, #2, #3, #4, owned by Northshore Market Investor LLC;
- •Northwest Middle School Park, owned by Knox County;
- Petsafe Downtown Dog Park, owned by Tennessee DOT;
- Sequoyah Hills Park, owned by TVA;
- Spring Place Park, owned by Knox County;
- •Thomas "Tank" Strickland Park, owned by Knox County; and
- •YMCA at West Hills / John Bynon Park, owned by YMCA.

The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 but

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 8 of 9

should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Floodway) district should remain F-1 and any overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Christenberry Community Center;
- •Cumberland Estates Recreation Center;
- •Deane Hill Recreation Center:
- •E.V. Davidson Recreation Center;
- •Fairview Recreation Center;
- •Happy Homes Community Center;•Knoxville Adaptive Recreation Center;
- Larry Cox Senior Center;
- •Milton Roberts Recreation Center;
- •New Hope Recreation Center;
- •Oakland Recreation Center; and
- •West Haven Recreation Center.

Parks recommended to retain the same zoning. The following park lands owned by the City are now zoned with classifications other than OS-1 and should remain zoned as they are. All but Lakeshore, parcel #2 are located downtown and have a D-1 overlay for protection. Lakeshore, parcel #2, currently is occupied by uses not listed in either the OS-1 or OS-2 zone districts, as proposed. If the desire of the planning commission is to recommend a change of zoning, these park lands should be zoned OS-2, except that areas currently zoned F-1 (Flood Way) district should remain F-1 and the D-1 overlay district should be retained, subject to the adoption of the OS-2 district:

- •Charles Krutch Park
- Market Square
- •World's Fair Park•Volunteer Landing Park
- •Lakeshore, Parcel #2
- •Badgett Road Parks #2 and #3

Action:	Approved		Meeting Date:	12/9/2010
Details of Action:				
Summary of Action:	rezone parks in the City and that City Council retain the zoning of certain parks and park areas as shown in Exhibit A			
Date of Approval:	12/9/2010	Date of Denial:	Postponements:	

Date of Withdrawal: Withdrawn prior to publication?:
Action Appealed?:

LEGISLATIVE ACTION AND DISPOSITION

Amendments:

Legislative Body:	Knoxville City Council
_09.0.40 _04.	ranoximo only obtained

Amendments:

Date of Legislative Action: 1/11/2011 Date of Legislative Action, Second Reading: 1/25/2011

Ordinance Number: Other Ordinance Number References:

Disposition of Case: Approved Disposition of Case, Second Reading: Approved

If "Other":

Date of Legislative Appeal: Effective Date of Ordinance:

1/26/2011 03:49 PM Page 9 of 9