

CASE SUMMARY

APPLICATION TYPE: USE ON REVIEW

KNOXVILLE-KNOX COUNTY

M P C
METROPOLITAN
P L A N N I N G
C O M M I S S I O N

T E N N E S S E E

Suite 403 • City County Building
400 Main Street
Knoxville, Tennessee 37902
865 • 215 • 2500
F A X • 215 • 2068
www.knoxmpc.org

File Number: 6-F-01-UR **Related File Number:**
Application Filed: 5/14/2001 **Date of Revision:**
Applicant: EAST TENNESSEE CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL
Owner:

PROPERTY INFORMATION

General Location: North side of White Ave., west of Twenty Second St.
Other Parcel Info.:
Tax ID Number: 108 C B 32.01, 35, 36 & 37 **Jurisdiction:** City
Size of Tract: 0.84 acres
Accessibility: Access is via White Ave., a local access street with a 29' pavement width within a 50' right-of-way.

GENERAL LAND USE INFORMATION

Existing Land Use: Parking lot and vacant land
Surrounding Land Use:
Proposed Use: Commercial parking garage **Density:**
Sector Plan: Central City **Sector Plan Designation:**
Growth Policy Plan: Urban Growth Area (Inside City Limits)
Neighborhood Context: The site is located at the western end of the hospital campuses in the Fort Sanders area and just south of the 23rd Street - Laurel Avenue residential neighborhood.

ADDRESS/RIGHT-OF-WAY INFORMATION (where applicable)

Street: 2215 White Ave
Location:
Proposed Street Name:
Department-Utility Report:
Reason:

ZONING INFORMATION (where applicable)

Current Zoning: O-1 (Office, Medical, and Related Services)
Former Zoning:
Requested Zoning:
Previous Requests:
Extension of Zone:
History of Zoning: None noted

PLAN INFORMATION (where applicable)

Current Plan Category:
Requested Plan Category:

SUBDIVISION INFORMATION (where applicable)

Subdivision Name:

Surveyor:

No. of Lots Proposed: No. of Lots Approved: 0

Variances Requested:

S/D Name Change:

OTHER INFORMATION (where applicable)

Other Bus./Ord. Amend.:

MPC ACTION AND DISPOSITION

Planner In Charge: TPB

Staff Recomm. (Abbr.): APPROVE the development plan for the parking garage, subject to 8 conditions:

Staff Recomm. (Full):

1. Meeting all applicable requirements of the Knoxville Zoning Ordinance.
2. Meeting all applicable requirements of the Knoxville Department of City Engineering.
3. Constructing the garage to a height not to exceed 45 feet or four stories.
4. Redesigning the parking drive aisle and spaces at each end of the garage on all floors to provide the required minimum 39 ft. width for both drive aisle and spaces.
5. Relocating the handicapped spaces from the west end of the first floor to the east end of the second floor for easier access to the outside and to the adjacent office building to the east.
6. Approval and certification of the final plat that will combine the subject property with that of the medical office to the east.
7. Installing proposed landscaping as shown on Sheet LP 100 of the site plan within six months of the issuance of the occupancy permit for this project.
8. A revised site plan reflecting the conditions of approval shall be submitted to MPC prior to the issuance of building permits for this project.

With the conditions noted, this plan for a parking garage meets the requirements for the approval of a use on review in the O-1 Zoning District.

Comments:

REQUEST OVERVIEW. The applicant is proposing to build a 536 space parking garage for employees of the East Tennessee Children's Hospital. The site for the garage is at the western end of White Ave., two blocks from the hospital. Adjacent to the site, on the east, is an existing one story medical office. Directly north of the site is the 23rd Street - Laurel Avenue residential neighborhood. The proposed garage has been designed with seven levels and a height of approximately 75'. The garage will have entrances/exits onto White Ave. The footprint of the garage is approximately 27,500 square feet and covers approximately 60 % of the development site.

FINAL PLAT. The applicant submitted a one lot subdivision plat for the combination of the six lots located on the north side of White Ave. and west of Twenty Second St. This includes both the site for the parking garage and the existing medical office. This plat is on the MPC's June 14, 2001 agenda.

BZA VARIANCES. The applicant filed an application with the BZA for the following six variances from the Zoning Ordinance:

1. Reduce west side yard setback from 15' to 9'.
2. Reduce the rear yard setback from 35' to 9'.
3. Increase building lot coverage from 35% to 60%.
4. Increase building height from 45' to 75' and the number of stories from 4 to 7.
5. Reduce required minimum clear distance in parking garage for 90 degree parking from 60' to 54' 7".
6. Reduce required minimum clear distance in parking garage for 65 degree parking from 56' to 54' 7".

All of the requested variances were approved by the BZA on May 17, 2001 except for the variance on the increase in the number of stories. The legal ad for the BZA meeting omitted that variance, therefore, it was not considered by the BZA. A variance for the increase in the number of stories would still be required. On the BZA application, the applicant had identified their hardship as follows: "Children's Hospital wishes to construct an employee parking garage the size of which will not meet existing setback, height and lot coverage requirements. Children's Hospital owns the property and wishes to build a larger structure than meets zoning requirements." It is Staff's position that there were no legal hardships identified that would prevent any reasonable use of the property under the terms of the Zoning Ordinance.

BUILDING PERMITS. The applicant applied for and obtained a Special Foundation Permit from the City of Knoxville Department of Development Inspection Bureau for the construction of caissons for the foundation. This permit was issued with the following notation: "Owner is proceeding at his own risk pending use-on-review and variance approval."

ONE YEAR PLAN. The One Year Plan identifies the block that includes the garage site as Mixed-Use with a designation of Office and Medium Density Residential. The residential area to the north is designated as Medium Density Residential.

FORT SANDERS NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN. The Fort Sanders Neighborhood Plan identifies this site as Office. The 23rd Street - Laurel Avenue residential neighborhood which is located directly north of the site is identified as Office for the houses located on the south side of Clinch Ave., and Low/Medium Density Residential for the area north of Clinch Ave. The 23rd Street - Laurel Avenue residential neighborhood is also identified in the plan as a Conservation Area that should be considered for nomination to the National Register and as a future NC-1 (Neighborhood Conservation Overlay) District. The Transportation Plan which designated proposed parking structures within the Fort Sanders Neighborhood did not identify any parking garages in this area.

BASIS FOR STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

While variances have been granted for an increase in the height of the building, it is staff's position that this 67% increase in the maximum height for a building in the O-1 District is not in keeping with other development in the neighborhood, and would have major impacts on the 23rd Street - Laurel Avenue residential neighborhood. With the combination of variances for increase in height and site coverage, and the reduction in rear yard setback, this proposed garage will create a wall that is 75' in height, 480' in length, approximately 50' from the rear of the houses along Clinch Ave. This building is also located along the southern exposure for those houses. After Staff's initial examination of the residential neighborhood, it is our position that the area would be eligible for listing as part of a proposed local or national historic register. This area which is comprised predominantly of craftsman houses (c. 1900-1920), retains much of the original architecture. There have been very few intrusions into this area, and the few intrusions that have occurred are consistent in scale to the residential buildings. The proposed parking garage is definitely not in scale with this historic residential neighborhood.

Staff is not in opposition to a parking garage at this location; however, we are opposed to a garage that exceeds the design standards for the O-1 District. Development within the O-1 District should act as a buffer or transition area between the residential neighborhood and the more intense commercial development. This is supported by the One Year Plan that identifies the site as medium density residential/office mixed use area. With its close proximity to the residential neighborhood, this site should not be approved for the intense type of development that the O-1 District is intended to buffer from residential uses.

Staff recommends that the applicant reduce the scale of the garage to comply with the O-1 District standards, or consider looking at the parking lot just south of the Children's Hospital as a site for the garage.

MPC Action: Approved **MPC Meeting Date:** 6/14/2001

- Details of MPC action:**
1. Meeting all applicable requirements of the Knoxville Zoning Ordinance.
 2. Meeting all applicable requirements of the Knoxville Department of City Engineering.
 3. (Deleted by MPC) Constructing the garage to a height not to exceed 45 feet or four stories.
 4. Redesigning the parking drive aisle and spaces at each end of the garage on all floors to provide the required minimum 39 ft. width for both drive aisle and spaces.
 5. Relocating the handicapped spaces from the west end of the first floor to the east end of the second floor for easier access to the outside and to the adjacent office building to the east.
 6. Approval and certification of the final plat that will combine the subject property with that of the medical office to the east.
 7. Installing proposed landscaping as shown on Sheet LP 100 of the site plan within six months of the issuance of the occupancy permit for this project.
 8. A revised site plan reflecting the conditions of approval shall be submitted to MPC prior to the issuance of building permits for this project.

With the conditions noted, this plan for a parking garage meets the requirements for the approval of a use on review in the O-1 Zoning District.

Summary of MPC action: APPROVE the development plan for the parking garage, subject to 7 conditions (MPC eliminated condition 3)

Date of MPC Approval: 6/14/2001 **Date of Denial:** **Postponements:**

Date of Withdrawal:

Withdrawn prior to publication?: Action Appealed?:

LEGISLATIVE ACTION AND DISPOSITION

Legislative Body:

Date of Legislative Action:

Ordinance Number:

Disposition of Case:

If "Other":

Amendments:

Date of Legislative Appeal:

Date of Legislative Action, Second Reading:

Other Ordinance Number References:

Disposition of Case, Second Reading:

If "Other":

Amendments:

Effective Date of Ordinance: